## Tocqueville's 1840 Assessment of American Democracy Versus Traditional Aristocracy

"My critics insist upon making me out a party-man; but I am not that. Passions are attributed to me where I have only opinions; or rather I have but one opinion, an enthusiasm for liberty and for the dignity of the human race. I consider all the forms of government only as so many more or less perfect means of satisfying this holy and legitimate craving. They ascribe to me alternately aristocratic and democratic prejudices. If I had been born in another period, or in another country, I might have had either the one or the other. But my birth, as it happened, made it easy to me to guard against both. I came into the world at the end of a long revolution, which, after destroying ancient institutions, had created none that could last. When I entered life, aristocracy was dead and democracy as yet unborn. My instinct, therefore, could not lead me blindly either to the one or to the other. I lived in a country which for forty years had tried everything, and settled nothing. I was on my guard, therefore, against political illusions. Myself belonging to the ancient aristocracy of my country, I had no natural hatred or jealousy of the aristocracy; nor could I have any natural affection for it, since that aristocracy had ceased to exist, and one can be strongly attached only to the living. I was near enough to know it thoroughly, and far enough to judge dispassionately. I may say as much for the democratic element. It had done me, as an individual, neither good nor harm. I had no personal motive, apart from my public convictions, to love or to hate it. Balanced between the past and the future, with no natural instinctive attraction towards either, I could without an effort look quietly on each side of the question."—Letter to Henry Reeve, 22 March 1837

	American Democracy	Traditional Aristocracy
<u>Science</u>	Applied sciences; more pragmatic and	Pure sciences; more theoretical; less
	monetary; pressure to produce	motivated by quick outcomes
<u>Arts</u>	Tendency towards cheap production in	Quality dominates and influences all
	mass quantities; more focused on the	classes' expectations; more focused on the
	useful and the realistic; less durable and	few goods produced for ideal beauty and
	more quickly discarded and replaced;	longevity; favors original productions
	favors faux-reproductions	
<u>Monuments</u>	Overcompensates with extremes sizes for	More traditional practice and expectations
	public buildings but little attention to other	across sizes and uses
	uses	
<u>Literature</u>	Widespread and popular works are	More singular, aloof, higher stress on
	stressed; cheaper printings, more often	quality and expense
	botched or lesser in quality	
<u>Language</u>	Heavy coinage of new words with high	More calculated and precise in use of
	ambiguity	language
<u>Poetry</u>	Tends to take the future and human	Prizes ideal beauty, history, the past,
	subjectivity as its subjects, less exalted and	singular works within a tradition
	more ambiguous	
<u>Drama</u>	More focused on emotion than plot; tends	Aristocracy tends to support works that
	to be out front in the popular viewpoints	focus on the noble few, though with
	and expectations	attendance across classes
<u>History</u>	Focuses on general sociological forces in	Tends to prize the history of great
	history	individuals
<u>Oratory</u>	Independent and competitive; inflated,	More precise and interdependent; focused
	even bizarre; worried about shaping the	on fine delivery
	public	

	American Democracy	Traditional Aristocracy
<u>Human</u>	Citizens tend to see each other as more	In traditional cultures, groups tend to only
<u>Dignity</u>	alike and thus see each other as human.	recognize the humanity of those within
		their social stations.
<u>Social</u>	Social relations based more around the	Aristocracies base their relations around
Relations	accumulation of wealth.	complex manners that reflect the expected
		behaviors of each class.
<u>Servant-</u>	Democracies do not remove class	English aristocracy has the tightest multi-
<u>Master</u>	distinctions but it softens them. There are	generational bonds between master and
<u>Relations</u>	no elite servants. A servant may one day be	servant, while France has the loosest.
	a master, and thus service is not regarded as degrading.	
Prices and	Tends to raise prices but shorten leases, for	Land leases are typically hereditary; thus, a
Leases	land tends to more regularly change hands.	long-term family-land dependence is
	Land owners have little worry about the	assumed. Likewise, land is held in
	workers since social mobility is possible.	perpetuity by aristocratic families.
Wages	Higher wages lead to workers having less	Aristocracies are land-based agricultural
	dependence upon industrial employers.	economies. In France, land-workers may
	(Tocqueville anticipates something like	have small plots of their own to fall back on
	unions.)	if wages fall in price.
<u>Families</u>	The democratic family shares work and has	More psychological distance between
	greater familiarity and tenderness. Children	fathers and children. Fathers serve as the
	regard each other as equals.	bond between past and present.
Girls and	Girls are raised in more open ways and are	Girls are more protected in aristocratic
Wives	prepared with religious and rational	cultures and less able to expect the costs of
	reasons for their behavior, while wives are	domestic life within a marriage. Wives in
	highly moral and regarded as the bedrock of American decency.	such an environment are, conversely more free yet also less faithful.
Equality	American democracy is superior in its	Forced marriages in aristocracies lead to
and Morals	valuing and practice of chastity. Their	more marital infidelity. Romantic fantasies
and Morais	marriages tend to stress shared concerns	and liability to seduction is another result.
	with property and more character equality.	and masmey to seddedon is another result.
Male-	The husband is regarded as the leader of	European flattery of women often has a
<u>Female</u>	the family, while women are bond to their	deeper level of contempt. Men are more
<u>Equality</u>	families, yet they are also protected against	likely to submit to women as sexual
	abusive divorce. Men have a general high	creatures yet treat them as incomplete
	regard for women and raise their level of	beings.
	education and culture.	
<u>Private</u>	Less social difference leads to more social	More social difference leads to little mixing
Societies	mixing and association.	and more class enclosures.
<u>Manners</u>	Manners breakdown more quickly across	Far more refined and exclusive of class-
	classes and their loss is not felt greatly.	markers. Tocqueville feels their loss keenly.
<u>Action</u>	They prefer substantive and productive	A preference for more dramatic and
	affairs with little interruption. All have a	romantic events, yet they are singular in
	high sense of personal worth. Yet they are	their focus on a goal, are attentive to
	also constantly busy and prone to be rash	matters at hand, and stress the long-term
	in financial decision-making.	matter.

	American Democracy	Traditional Aristocracy
<u>National</u>	Americans tend to be assertive and	Europeans are more reserved about their
<u>Pride</u>	argumentative about their greatness as a	country's greatness, which takes more
	country and a people.	haughty forms.
<u>Fixed</u>	Their lives are busier yet more	Fewer desires of a grander nature. They are
<u>Spheres</u>	monotonous. Industry begins about a	more diverse in their cultural attainments.
	general sameness of existence.	
<u>Honor</u>	Honor is more fluid and based about	Held highly in regard and central to class
	commercial achievements. Without caste	importance. The validity of acts is class-
	divisions, it is less important.	based.
<u>Ambition</u>	Ambitions tend to be of a smaller, more	Ambitions are for greater, more noble ends.
	material nature focused on the immediate.	The end is to be great and in a highly-
	The end is to be a pioneer.	regarded public office.
Revolutions	The economic values of democracy actually	Aristocracies are more liable to great
	lead to less social change in the long-run	revolutions because of the high value
	because they want to protect their	placed on honor and because agriculture
	monetary achievements which are more	wealth is less likely to be lost. Thus, they
	mobile in nature.	fear conquest more.
<u>War</u>	Democracies prefer despotism to wars	Aristocracies prefer war to despotism
	because their property attainments are	because of their high stress on personal
	more likely to survive. Conversely there is	honor. And yet aristocratic armies are class-
	more promotion in a democratic army so	based and less invested in actual battles.
	soldiers are more invested in wars, and	They do not survive as easily protracted
	their armies can survive longer wars with	wars since their leadership is full of young,
	the inevitable rise of new driven leadership.	angry men who may or not be great
		strategists.